

YGT WEBSITE

YGT CONSERVATION AND PLANNING December 2020

Cherish the past, adorn the present, construct for the future.

Many of you will know Portmeirion near Portmadog, the creation of Sir Clough Williams- Ellis (1883-1978). However, I have only just discovered Plas Brondanw. This is the family's old manor house that was given to Clough in a bad state for his 21st birthday and which he used to develop his architectural and garden design ideas and where he lived until his death in 1978. It is now owned by a registered charity called Ymddiriedolaeth Clough Williams-Ellis Foundation (www.brandanw.org) and overseen by his gardening granddaughter Menna Angharad. If you have never visited then I thoroughly recommend it as indeed I do Sir Clough's message which is as clear and relevant now as when he wrote it many years ago: ***Cherish the past, adorn the present, construct for the future.***

The gardens of Plas Brondanw are grade I on the Cadw list and are a beautiful design of commanding viewpoints and vistas aimed at Snowdonia summits and intimate enclosed compartments. He loved colour and painted his architectural features such as gates turquoise with mustard detailing which does seem to work well.

It struck me that as we are all living through such unpredictable and difficult times Sir Clough's message is heartening and something which many of us are trying to do in the face of many who seem to want to do the opposite.

This year the YGT Conservation and Planning Sub-committee have met on the 10th March, fortunately, just before lockdown, and then again via Zoom on 8th July and 29th September. Although it's good to see and speak with each other via a Zoom meeting, I do find that it is quite taxing and I miss the camaraderie and chit-chat pre- and post- meeting that we have when we meet face-to-face. Between the 10th March and 31st August we have responded to fifty- seven planning applications and it was noticeable that during lockdown the rate of consultations did not abate, in fact there seems to have been a greater number. I think that we are being consulted by Yorkshire's Local Planning Authorities (LPA) more widely than ever. Let's hope that our advice is seen as helpful and can be acted upon. It certainly seems that some LPA's return to us for further advice on a particular planning issue where we have registered an objection or concerns. We continue to work with the Gardens Trust (GT) and Historic England (HE) and are grateful for the support and advice that we get from Chris Mayes, HE's Heritage at Risk Landscape Architect for the North of England. Chris usually attends our meetings as on occasion does our good friend from Natural England, Dr Margaret Nieke.

Returning to some of the planning applications that I wrote about in Issue 46, Spring 2020 and where we have updates.

At **Wentworth Castle** there has been a revised application to replace the existing bungalow called Pine Lodge. The revision had little change and did not address our concerns so we strongly objected as did HE and the National Trust (NT).

In July we responded to revised plans for the mansion house, associated buildings including camellia house, car parking infrastructure and landscaping at **Bretton Hall**. As a result of our detailed response, particularly regarding our concerns with the car parking, access and landscaping, we have been invited to a site visit with the planning and conservation officers of Wakefield Council and the developers in November.

The Yorkshire Dales National Park Authority (YDNPA) has continued to consult us over further amended plans for **Marske Hall in Swaledale**. This historic site with a grade II* Hall and an of assemblage other listed buildings faces an uncertain future with a difficult situation due to its topography, layout and finding suitable places for a large amount of car parking. The applicant withdrew the first submission in March. YGT has expressed support in principle but both the subsequent revised submission for 20 apartments and events spaces, and then the amended plans in July for an aparthotel and events space in the sawmill and kennels have not fully resolved the car parking problem. Subsequently we have learned that HE has expressed the same concerns about the harm that the car parking would cause to the heritage assets. We have now explained to the Principal Planner at the YDNPA that we have no further advice and leave it to

their expertise. We were disappointed to learn that our application to HE to consider Marske Hall for the Register of Historic Parks and Gardens was regrettably declined.

At the beginning of April, we were consulted on the National Trust Proposals for the Café Building at Canal Gates, **Studley Royal** - Heritage Impact Scoping Report "*Studley Revealed*": *Proposed renovation and development at Canal Gates, Studley Royal*. Together with the GT we wrote of our strong support for the NT's charitable purpose to provide physical and intellectual access to special places and the great conservation, repair and presentation work that has been done over many decades to sites owned and managed by the NT. However, we explained that we remain very concerned about the proposals for the Café Building at Canal Gates, Studley Royal and although the HIA Scoping Report goes into considerable detail it does not allay our concerns about the whole concept and the GT/YGT is unable to endorse these proposals. We have not heard anything further.

The following are some of the other planning applications that we've responded to:

East Yorkshire

Looking to the east of the county we have had practical, well-thought through and sympathetic planning applications for alterations to the terrace café at **Sledmere House** and the use of the Great Hall at **Burton Constable** for weddings. However, the reinstatement of **East Park, Kingston upon Hull**, paddling pool was a poorly documented application and took me some considerable time to gather sufficient information to make an informed response and advise on the exterior works and planting. That was a pity as East Park is a significant and well-loved park and the largest park in Hull. Designed by Joseph Fox Sharp, the Borough Engineer for Kingston-Upon-Hull and opened in 1887, it is reminiscent of Pearson Park to the north of the city and includes a carriage drive around its perimeter. There have been many C20 additions and changes to the park including the addition of land for the boating lake to the north of the park which was presented by the businessman and philanthropist Thomas Ferrers in 1913. Further land was added in the 1920's and although much of the original layout of the park has been retained, parts were adapted during the second half of the C20.

North Yorkshire and York

We have had our first planning application for a gin distillery; now that wouldn't have happened in the early years of YGT! So, like much else, YGT records the fashions of the times whether it's for horticulture, design, leisure or indeed imbibing alcohol – perhaps we should raise a glass. The planning application from the owners of Whitby Gin is for the alteration and extension of old agricultural buildings/barns on land south of Whitby Abbey. The buildings are listed and the site is within the Whitby Conservation Area, part of the grade I Whitby Abbey House complex, close to the scheduled Whitby Abbey and the north barn lies within the grade II Registered Historic Park and Garden of Whitby Abbey House. After expressing our concerns about insufficient information on the archaeology of this very historic site and impact on the views, we received additional documents and had no objection.

Moving up and down the coast we have had concerning planning applications for properties in Sandsend close to the eastern boundary of the grade II* park of **Mulgrave Castle**. At Scarborough we have advised on two planning applications that potentially could affect the **Valley Gardens and South Cliff** but pleasingly these should have good outcomes.

The **University of York** has submitted planning applications for alterations to University Central Hall including a new plaza and also for changes around the Physics Building. The application sites are situated in the University of York's Campus West and the Campus West designed landscape which is on the Historic England Register of Historic Parks and Gardens at Grade II and was designed by Robert Matthew, Johnson-Marshall & Partners (RMJM). It was registered due to its historic and design interest, landscaping, designers, degree of survival and group value of the University buildings. For the Central Hall application, we queried the lighting, planting and paths and the lack of Environmental Impact Statement particularly because of the close proximity to the lake and we suggested a landscape management plan. I was grateful for advice from Win Derbyshire who knows the campus and whose late husband's cousin was architect for the development of the University, and YGT Chairman Chris, who as former Keeper of Archives at the Borthwick Institute also knows the University well. Also, in York we have had a variation of condition for an earlier application at **York Cemetery**. The planning application for a new healthcare centre

building for the Schoen Clinic York at **The Retreat** which is on the Register of Historic Parks and Gardens at Grade II*, has caused us some disquiet. The Retreat dates from 1792-96 and is the earliest example of the expression of so-called moral therapy in an asylum estate landscape. It was the most influential model for public asylum estates during the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, its example being developed but not entirely superseded. It was influential beyond England, in Europe and North America. We concurred with the comments from the York City Council Conservation Architect and the Landscape Architect and the points made by HE and thought that the development would not comply with the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 or the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF).

South of York we have had two planning applications for **Moreby Hall** and one for a replacement care home at **Scarthingwell Park** at Barkston Ash.

Scarthingwell Park is not included by HE on their Register of Parks & Gardens, however although the house was demolished in the 1960's and was replaced by a care home, Scarthingwell Park is a locally important historic park and garden for Selby DC and for planning purposes, the parkland is considered to have status equivalent to that of a non-designated heritage asset. Some research has been done by the YGT Research and Recording group which was very helpful and although we had no objection to this planning application, we did have some concerns and strongly supported the advice of Selby DC's Conservation Officer and Principal Landscape Architect.

Scarthingwell Park is near the Towton battlefield and from the 18th century Scarthingwell Park was an ornamental designed landscape centred on the hall. The first record of the designing of the landscape at Scarthingwell comes from 1790 when John Davenport, a nurseryman from Shropshire was employed by Lord Hawke to form a lake and build a bridge across it. www.parksandgardens.org/people/john-davenport

John Davenport was a nurseryman from Burlton Grove, Wem, Shropshire, active in the 1780s and 1790s, with a speciality in hothouses. Davenport claimed to have been in business since 1768 'imployd in considerable Buildings of Houses for gentlemen as well as their Grounds &c.'. He designed an elaborate picturesque landscape for Warren Hastings, Governor General of India at Daylesford House, Gloucestershire, but was dismissed in 1791. Davenport's client at Scarthingwell Park, Admiral Hawke, was a prominent 18th century naval commander and it may be that he engaged Davenport in the 1790's. As a nurseryman Davenport may also have been involved in the laying out of the parkland (then c.160acres) and more formal gardens to the west.

Moreby Hall was erected on the site of an earlier house for the Preston family, well-known merchants and bankers from Leeds, in 1828-33. It was only the second country house by renowned architect Anthony Salvin (1799-1881), designed shortly after he had gone to live in London where he worked for many years with his brother-in-law the significant landscape gardener William Andrews Nesfield, and the architects John L Pearson and R Norman Shaw. The terraced gardens were laid out to compliment the new house by John Burr, head gardener at the time, and included topiary, summerhouses, a rosery, bowling green and a serpentine lake as shown on the OS 1st Edition surveyed 1846. The *Country Life* article of 1907 favourably compares the gardens to those of the famous Westmorland [now Cumbria] House of Levens. The national importance of Moreby Hall is reflected in its Grade II* listing and there are a number of Grade II Listed Structures within the Registered Historic Park and Garden. We gave advice on the car parking and gardens (registered grade II) as part of the conversion of the hall to eleven apartments but opposed the unacceptable conversion of the garage, as did the Selby DC Conservation Officer.

West Yorkshire

Horton Park, Bradford and the Joseph Nutter Orphanage adjacent to it.

Built by Victorian philanthropy, this orphanage was gifted to the city in an expression of civic pride in 1888. The turrets and ramparts make for unique elevations, and the building is vital to the context of the surrounding parkland.

These words can be found on the website [https://demolitionregister.org/The Demolition Register](https://demolitionregister.org/The%20Demolition%20Register), which charts all proposals to demolish historic buildings in Yorkshire. Despite many objections, including from the Victorian Society and Bradford Civic Society, demolition took place in May last year. We had not been informed of this application, which was validated on 18 March 2019 with permission soon granted on 11th April. The building was not listed, nor in a conservation area, nor included within the registered Grade II

area of Horton Park, yet the orphanage and Horton Park had shared borrowed landscapes and an intertwined history.

Horton Park, opened in 1878, was designed by William Gay, one of the finest Victorian landscapers in the north. Gay is perhaps best known for his cemeteries, including Undercliffe Cemetery, (established 1854) and Toxteth Park Cemetery, Liverpool (opened 1856), but he also designed parks including Saltaire Park (Roberts Park). He was one of the most imaginative and gifted designers of the period, using "raised and sunken terraces to enhance the complexities of the landscape" such as the grand terrace at Peel Park. At Horton Park a double-span cast-iron bridge carries the principal promenade over a lake at the centre of the site. Ten years later the grounds in front of the orphanage were laid out in a style similar to that of Horton Park with low walls between the properties acting as ha-has, whilst a sunken public footpath ran between with mirrored pedestrian entrances to the Park and Orphanage. The latter enabled easy access to the park, not for play, but for the undertaking of regular maintenance of the park required of each orphan.

So, this April we responded to an application that squeezes eleven large dwellings into the approximately one-acre site by using a rigid geometrical style layout. It appears to be over-development. Trees would need to be felled and those remaining likely to be impacted both by the building work and afterwards. This is in contrast to the Nutter Orphanage that had been set back by perhaps 20m giving an apron of greenspace to visually flow into the park and vice versa.

In this proposal none of these large family houses would be built with a garage. Not only would this lead to views from Horton Park being marred by cars, but most likely additional buildings too, due to the lack of any indoor storage space for bicycles, gardening equipment, etc. As the land adjacent to the public footpath bounding the site would be completely privately owned there would be no control over the landscaping of these plots and hence their contribution to the setting of Horton Park. We totally agreed with the pre-application enquiry response, that the trees along the boundary should not be retained within domestic curtilage, but in areas of public or shared open space maintained through a management agreement. So, in summary we considered that this planning application as submitted would result in harm to the setting and significance of Horton Park. This application has caused much controversy, as it is thought that there was a covenant on the orphanage building restricting its use to educational purposes.

The iconic stone Victorian mansion, **The Mount, adjacent to Peel Park, Bradford** was featured in the Autumn 2019 newsletter as there was then a major planning application to convert it into 26 apartments together with a large extension for an additional 28. This was eventually withdrawn on 6 August 2019. We were thus shocked to see recently a new application for a residential development of 13 dwellings, Former Mount Nursing Home. We had again not been informed of the proposed demolition and have since failed to trace any demolition application or find any reference to it in the media, including the Demolition Register for buildings in Yorkshire mentioned above.

The Mount too had its own private entrance to the adjacent public park, but this was for pleasure and directly to the Park's Carriage Drive; the stone gate piers of this entrance are still extant. The original landscaping around the stone mansion provided a picturesque setting both from within the park and its approach from Bolton Road. Much of the original layout of the gardens remained unchanged until at least the 1930s and can be seen in the 1938 C. H. Woods aerial photo of Peel Park (N2357, C. H. Woods Collection, Bradford Museums and Galleries). This picturesque setting also features in several early postcards of Peel Park.

The applicant claims that the existing dense boundary planting on the southern boundary of the application site would ensure that the proposed two storey housing would not be visible from Peel Park. But the photo of The Mount in the Autumn 2019 newsletter shows this is clearly not the case for at least half the year when the trees are not in leaf. So, a detailed landscaping plan is essential but was not submitted. We do not consider that the style of the proposed housing to be sympathetic to the views from the Park and have objected to this application in its present form. We heard in August that this planning application had been refused.

We have had two recent applications for the former **High Royds** Hospital, Menston, with the proposal to convert its Victorian covered reservoir into eight residential units the more major.

The West Riding Pauper Lunatic Asylum, Menston was built on 300 acres of agricultural land formerly owned by the Fawkes family of Farnley Hall and was designed to be totally self-sufficient. It opened in 1888

and by 1898 had 1526 patients. To the west is the early to mid C17 farmhouse High Royds Hall. The covered reservoir is beyond sited near Matthew Dike, its stream flowing down from Reva Hill close to Hawksworth Moor further to the west. The beautiful rural setting of this reservoir was described as "sublime" in a Consultation Draft - August 2017, AIREBOROUGH LANDSCAPE CHARACTER & VALUE REPORT.

Though High Royds is on the HE Register (Grade II), the reservoir is not included in the registered area, nor is its associated Pump House. However, the reservoir remains part of High Royds setting, regarding the western view across agricultural land to Hawksworth Moor, and lies within the Green Belt.

In 2017, a pre-application enquiry based on a conversion scheme to four self-contained dwellings with associated car parking and amenity space, was notified that such a proposal would be over-development and intrusive in its rural setting, and impact on the openness and character and appearance of the Green Belt at this location. Subsequently change of use to a single dwelling was approved.

This application for eight dwellings would result in much structural damage to the original Victorian building, and in particular through doubling the height of the proposed windows in the east and west elevations. It would be far more prominent in the landscape, which is contrary to the original intended design. It would also result in considerably increased vehicle movements on a public footpath and the possibility of more domestic items in the curtilage. We objected to this application as proposed as we did not consider that it would protect the setting of High Royds.

We have learnt very recently that it has been refused – reasons for refusal included inappropriate development in the Green Belt and harm to the character of a Heritage Asset and its setting.

At **Harewood House** we commented late last year on an application to partially demolish and rebuild Forge House, the former blacksmith's workshop, together with a single storey extension to form offices. Forge House lies within the Grade I registered park and garden, and on the southern side of the Estate Yard at Home Farm, adjacent to the approach to Harewood House from Weardley. This approach, by way of Lady Bridge, the Menagerie, and then Home Farm at Stank, is part of Harewood's designed landscape by Lancelot (Capability) Brown and others with the "Tower"/Granary just to the west of Forge-House, a principal feature. The Estate Yard was designed in the style of a courtyard farmstead and all its buildings and Lady Bridge were designed by John Carr, the principal designer of Harewood House.

Home Farm has been described as "*one of the most extensive survivals of its type in England*" and the Estate Yard "*the first of its kind in a country house estate and showed a progressive attitude to the estate workforce*".

Forge House is clearly in a very poor state of repair and we would like to support sympathetic proposals that would ensure its repair and long-term use. However, we had some reservations about this proposal and in particular on the impact of the large extension, but also on the proposed new opening onto the historic approach to Harewood House.

We have recently commented on amended plans but these have been only slightly modified and have not addressed our concerns that these proposals would cause harm to the setting and significance of the Estate Yard and in particular the imposing "Tower" building.

We are very pleased that a new Conservation Management Plan is being drawn up for Harewood House Park and Gardens by Haworth Tompkins. This will cover the whole of the registered area so combining the interests of the Harewood House Trust and the Harewood Estate. Along with other organisations we were invited to attend a Zoom meeting in October when Beatie Blakemore of the consultants gave a presentation of the draft report. The ideas for the long-term conservation and management of this special place were inspiring and particularly with the strategy of the Harewood House Trust and Estate working closely together to conserve and sustain the whole area whilst finding new and exciting ways of presentation to the public.

Also, in West Yorkshire we have responded to an application for a shed and veranda for ice cream sales at the Mereside Visitor Centre, **Shibden Park**. Kath Gibson was involved with the very nice contemporary design for the Visitor Centre a few years ago, so to find an application for a poor utilitarian building alongside was most disappointing and we have objected. As you will know Shibden Hall House is a 15th Century and later, manor house and is listed grade II*. The landscape park is grade II on the Register of Historic Parks and Gardens and was laid out for the owner Jeremy Lister in the 1830's when the estate was managed by his daughter Anne Lister. She employed the architect John Harper of York to remodel the Hall and provide proposals for structural works in the grounds which were implemented by William Gray of York who also worked at Clumber Park. It is of course the home and setting for 'Gentleman Jack'.

Geoff Hughes helped me with two applications in Huddersfield for properties on the boundaries of public parks; **Greenhead Park** and **Beaumont Park**. Ridgemoor, No 64 Beaumont Park Road, was in the cluster of early properties built round the park in the late 19C. It had been allowed to fall into disrepair to the extent that an applicant gained consent to demolish it. (Where have we heard that before.) GT/YGT objected to an earlier application but found the new application significantly better so that we did not object but gave advice on the elevation that overlooks the park and planting. Overlooking the monumental two-sided promenade terrace and War Memorial at Greenhead Park, 34 Greenhead Road had been subject to some unsympathetic alterations during the 20th century. In addition, the site has been left vacant since 2012 and had fallen into a poor state of repair. We thought that this was a sound application which should bring the buildings and grounds into good use whilst respecting the heritage assets.

Thornes Park, Wakefield - We have had two applications; the retrospective siting of a metal storage container for the storage of bikes and PPE in connection with a tandem club for visually impaired adults, and proposals to rebuild Thornes Park Stadium. The metal storage container is near the rose garden and the documents submitted were poor; we gave advice on the colour of the container and planting that could improve the look of the area. The ageing Stadium was fire damaged earlier this year and we again gave advice and also suggestions as to how the park's existing infrastructure could be consolidated into less space freeing up more of the green areas. We also mentioned our Small Grant Scheme

South Yorkshire

We have been pleased that apart from Kenwood Hall Hotel, the recent applications in Sheffield have not caused us any concern. **Graves Park**, a significant and well-loved park, the largest public park in the City, forms the setting for Norton Hall (grade II*). The historic park retains much of the parkland character of the original grounds of the hall and, with its varied topography gives the community various recreational opportunities. This application was for changes to Graves Park Animal Farm.

Hillsborough Park is directly adjacent to the A61 Penistone Road and surrounded by residential and industrial and commercial areas with Sheffield Wednesday Football Club's Hillsborough Stadium nearby. The Park is a Conservation area and contains several Grade II listed buildings and structures and appears on the Local Register of Historic Parks and Gardens. The park is part of the original setting of Hillsborough Hall, (1779, listed grade II) one of the few examples of a large 18th century classical house in Sheffield and designed by Robert Adam. The park is contemporary with the house and was laid out in the tradition of English landscape parks with trees planted in naturalistic groups in open parkland, a lime avenue from the Penistone Road Lodge and a tree belt lining the south and south east boundary of the park. The HE Risk Register listing for the park notes that the current condition of the Hillsborough Park conservation is poor, its vulnerability is low, however its trend is deteriorating. But this was a well-documented application for a bike track and further public facilities that would be desirable at the Park and we agreed that the proposed site is the best location that would not impose on the Conservation Area status and heritage of the park.

The planning application for 101 dwellings with associated infrastructure (Pennine Village) was the largest housing development that we've been consulted upon this year. It is on land opposite Manor Lodge with the registered **City Road Cemetery** to its south west. We suggested that some evergreen planting such as holly, laurel, Scots pine could be incorporated into the deciduous belt of trees along the eastern boundary of the cemetery adjacent to the development.

Kenwood Hall Hotel, Sheffield – Two planning applications: the demolition of the Banqueting Suite etc and erection of a block of 7 apartments; and the demolition of outbuildings and erection of 4 dwellings. We have strongly object to both these which in their present form will harm Kenwood Hall, the Nether Edge Conservation Area and the Kenwood Character Area. We have had very knowledgeable help from Dr Jan Woudstra at the University of Sheffield. This has been particularly pertinent as I have been unable to visit Sheffield for 9 months but stayed at Kenwood Hall about five years ago. Kenwood Hall is Sheffield's largest surviving private example, (as opposed to a public park), of the work of the nationally acclaimed designer Robert Marnock (1800-89). Marnock was commissioned by George Wostenholm, a successful cutlery manufacturer, to design the garden at Kenwood and also the layout of the surrounding residential development carried out by Wostenholm. Wostenholm started buying land in the area of Cherry Tree Hill in 1834, though he did not build Kenwood till 1844, by which stage Marnock was already involved

Post War Landscapes. Twenty landscapes and gardens that have been added to the National Heritage List for England and I would just like to mention Cummins Engine Factory at Darlington. I know that it's not in Yorkshire but living in the north of the county I fairly often drive past it. It's always stood out as an innovative design but I never knew its history. The landscape was designed between 1964 and 1966 by Dan Kiley, who is considered to be the father of modern landscape architecture in the United States. And I've just learned that Roger Lambert's father was the landscape contractor for the work; so, a current Yorkshire connection. Mr Kiley worked closely with the factory architect Kevin Roche of Roche and Dinkeloo to create a deceptively simple landscape of grass, with a rectangular reservoir at the front of the imposing factory building. Historic England writes that the design strips back the three principle elements of landscape design – trees, water and grass – to a minimalist and pure form to complement the main building which is listed grade II*. The reservoir is kerbed by the same blue brindle bricks used in the factory building and acts as a reflecting pond. The site is bounded by original Cor-ten fencing (listed at grade II*) of the same red coloured oxidising steel as the building. If you are going out of Darlington on the B6280 to the A66 ring-road near Morrisons then you will pass Cummins Engine Factory on the right. It is stunning... and well-done to those who made the decision to build something outstanding here during the 1960's.

YGT Small Grants Scheme. As you will have read in YGT E-Bulletin No 2, July 2020 we have been delighted to welcome Brendan Mowforth to co-ordinate our scheme and it was a pleasure to see him via Zoom at our Conservation meeting in July. Do get in touch with him if you have ideas of where we could help with our grants. His contact is on our website under Small Grants Scheme.

Edwardian Gardens Continuing Professional Development event at Lotherton Hall on Wednesday 7th July 2021.

We are delighted that in association with Leeds CC and Lotherton Hall, we've been able to re-arrange the event for next July.

The programme will remain the same with experts; Mette Eggen, landscape architect from Norway, Dr John Grimshaw, director of the Yorkshire Arboretum, Jane Furse, landscape architect and historic garden specialist and Chris Flynn, Head Gardener, Dyffryn, NT of Wales.

Val Hepworth

Trustee